Animal Welfare Certification

Corporate Transparency, Accountability, and Animal Welfare

Nicole E. Negowetti
Clinical Instructor
Harvard Law School Food Law and Policy Clinic
Consumers Demand “Humanely-Raised” Animal Products
84% of consumers view “better living conditions for farm animals” as “very important” or “important.”

(2015 Consumer Reports Survey)

74% of consumers say they are paying more attention than they were five years ago to labels reflecting how animals are raised.

(2016 Lake Research Partners Survey)

Learn more about welfare certification by downloading the guide at aspca.org/farmcertification
67% of consumers state they would purchase welfare-certified products even if it means a modest rise in price.

(2016 Lake Research Partners Survey)

Farmers report receiving double-digit premiums for welfare-certified products.

Learn more about welfare certification by downloading the guide at aspca.org/farmcertification
TRUST US! all NATURAL!
DEFINITELY NOT TERRIBLE
Artisanal grade
ORGANIC
HORMONE FREE
SUPER Fancy
Antiobiotic-Free
“Humanely-Raised”
USDA Regulation of Animal Welfare Claims

- USDA Food Safety Inspection Service (FSIS) pre-approves labels on meat and poultry.

- All labels with special claims — including those relating to animal raising practices — must be submitted to the FSIS before being used on a product.

- To obtain approval of the claim, the company must submit an application and the FSIS will determine if “the animal raising information submitted with the label application” is “truthful and not misleading.” 9 CFR 412.1(c)(3).
Label Verification

- On October 5, 2016, the FSIS issued an updated compliance guideline on labeling and documentation needed to substantiate animal raising claims for label submission. Documentation needed:
  - A detailed description explaining the controls used for ensuring that the raising claim is valid from birth to harvest or the period of raising being referenced by the claim;
  - A signed and dated document describing how the animals are raised (e.g., vegetarian-fed) to support that the specific claim made is truthful and not misleading;
  - A description of the product tracing and segregation mechanism from time of slaughter or further processing through packaging and wholesale or retail distribution;
  - A written description for the identification, control, and segregation of non-conforming animals or products; and
  - If a third-party certifies a claim, a current copy of the certificate.
Defining “Animal Welfare”

◊ “Five Freedoms” defined by the UK Farm Animal Welfare Council
  ◦ Freedom from hunger and thirst;
  ◦ Freedom from discomfort;
  ◦ Freedom from pain, injury or disease;
  ◦ Freedom to express normal behavior; and
  ◦ Freedom from fear and distress.

◊ Animal welfare has also been defined in terms of
  ◦ Physical environment of the animal (e.g., shelter, feed),
  ◦ How an animal feels (typically measured by behavior), and
  ◦ The extent to which an animal can express “natural” behaviors.
Meaning in the Marketplace

- No legal definitions exist for the terms “animal welfare,” “humane,” or “animal care.”
- Moreover, USDA has never officially acknowledged any particular set of animal standards as representing acceptable supporting evidence for the use of welfare-related claims.
- FSIS has evaluated animal raising claims by considering information on animal raising practices submitted by companies as part of their label approval requests.
- The Agency has approved such claims if the animal raising information submitted with the label application supported the claim being made and the claim is truthful and not misleading.
Animal Welfare Institute (AWI) Investigation

- AWI submitted more than a dozen FOIA requests to evaluate USDA’s process for approving animal welfare and environmental claims, covering 25 claims appearing on the labels of 19 meat and poultry products.
- USDA was unable to locate any documents for 20 of the 25 claims.
- USDA provided very limited documentation for the other 5 claims.
- E.g., For the claim “humanely raised on sustainable family farms”—approved for use on one turkey producer’s products—supporting documentation consisted of an affidavit containing only two sentences pertaining to the claim.
“Organic”

- Must be raised organically on certified organic pastures
- Must be fed certified organic feed for their entire lives
- No drugs, antibiotics or growth hormones are allowed
- Must have year-round outdoor access
- Animals’ organic feed cannot contain animal by-products, antibiotics or genetically engineered grains and cannot be grown using persistent pesticides or chemical fertilizers.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assumption</th>
<th>% of Organic Consumers who believe true</th>
<th>NOP Requirement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Outdoor Access: All animals have access to outdoor pasture and fresh air throughout the day</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>No clear requirement: The type and length of outdoor access required contain numerous loopholes, and varies greatly from farm to farm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Space: Animals have significantly more space to move than on non-organic farms.</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>No clear requirement: NOP standards do not require a numerically expressed minimum amount of space per animal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genetic Engineering: Animals are not bred to grow so fast they have trouble moving and standing.</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>No cap on growth rates: NOP standards do not cap growth or production rates. Breeds designed for maximum meat, egg and milk production can be and are used.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Alterations: Animals do not have their beaks and tails cut off.</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>Allowed: According to NOP standards, physical alterations such as tail docking, debeaking, and castration may still be practiced.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
"Meating" Expectations of the Consumer
Final Organic Rule

On January 19, 2017 USDA published the final rule on animal welfare standards for organic livestock and poultry in the Federal Register.

- Establishes minimum indoor and outdoor space requirements for poultry
- Clarifies how producers and handlers must treat livestock and chickens to ensure their health and well-being throughout life, including transport and slaughter, and
- Specifies which physical alterations are allowed and prohibited in organic livestock and poultry production.

On December 18, 2017, USDA announced its intent to withdraw the rule, stating that the rules exceed the agency’s statutory authority under the Organic Foods Production Act of 1990.
Incorporates feedback from approximately 6700 public comments

Provisions:

Outside time for all species: When temperatures are between 40-90°

Goal: Less than 10 PPM indoor Ammonia levels. Over 25 PPM prohibited.

2.25 lbs per square foot required layer outdoor space.

GROUP Housing required for swine (except for special conditions).

Poultry house exits must ensure ready outdoor access for all birds.

6 inches of perch space per bird.

Organic feed & water required for all species being transported for 12+ hours.

Outdoor requirements for all species.
Third-Party Certifications

*Meets Humane Farm Animal Care Standards, which include nutritious diet without antibiotics or hormones, animals raised with shelter, resting areas, sufficient space and the ability to engage in natural behaviors.
5 STEP ANIMAL WELFARE RATING

WORKING TOGETHER TO RAISE THE QUALITY OF LIFE FOR FARM ANIMALS

1. NO CRATES, NO CAGES, NO CROWDING
2. ENRICHED ENVIRONMENT
3. ENHANCED OUTDOOR ACCESS
4. PASTURE CENTERED
5. ANIMAL CENTERED; ALL PHYSICAL ALTERATIONS PROHIBITED
5+. ANIMAL CENTERED; ENTIRE LIFE ON SAME FARM

A MULTI-TIERED PROGRAM THAT SUPPORTS AND RECOGNIZES FARMERS AND RANCHERS FOR THEIR EMPHASIS ON THE WELL-BEING OF ANIMALS
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step 1</th>
<th>Step 2</th>
<th>Step 3</th>
<th>Step 4</th>
<th>Step 5</th>
<th>Step 5+</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No crates, no cages, no crowding</td>
<td>Enriched environment</td>
<td>Enhanced outdoor access</td>
<td>Pasture centered</td>
<td>Animal centered; all physical alterations prohibited</td>
<td>Animal centered; entire life on same farm</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Like people, animals need a little "personal space" to be comfortable.

It's the simple things that keep animals active and engaged — like a bale of straw for chickens to hide behind and climb on, a bowling ball for pigs to manipulate and shove around, or a few sturdy objects for cattle to rub against when they need a good scratch.

Pigs and chickens still live in buildings but they all — yes, each and every one of them — have access to outdoor areas where they can catch a few rays.

Chickens need to forage, pigs need to wallow and cattle need to roam. They can do all of these things when they live outdoors and have shelter — and of course, a view!

Animals get to live their lives with all the parts they were born with, and nothing else! No nose rings, no clipping, no snipping and no branding.

Animals are born and live their entire lives on one farm. Pigs and cattle are slaughtered on the farm, and chickens are transported only short distances (because you can't herd chickens!).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>United Egg Producers Certified</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>0.5 sq. ft.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organic Valley Certified</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>1.2 sq. ft.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certified Humane Raised &amp; Handled</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>1.5 sq. ft.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USDA Organic</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Animal Partnership</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Minimum of 7 inches for perches required</td>
<td>Steps 1 and 2 - not required, steps 3-5 required</td>
<td>No, but &quot;birds should have periods of light and darkness&quot; using artificial light.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal Welfare Approved</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>1.8 sq. ft. for indoor roosting spaces</td>
<td>Yes: &gt;4 sq. ft. of green pasture per hen</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Possibilities to Improve Transparency and Accountability

- Uniform standard of “humane”/“animal welfare” established by USDA
- Third-party accreditation of all animal welfare claims submitted to USDA for pre-market approval
- Media campaigns by animal advocacy and consumer protection organizations to inform consumers of misleading claims
- Stricter animal welfare requirements by retailers